

THE EFFECTIVENESS OF PROBLEM-BASED LEARNING IN STUDENTS' LISTENING SKILL IN TOEIC OF LISTENING MATERIALS AT INDONESIAN ACADEMY OF SECRETARY AND MANAGEMENT CITRA NUSANTARA

By

Bahing Siritman¹, Mayang Meilantine²

^{1,2} Department of English Study Program, Post Graduate Program (Magister) of Language and Art, Palangka Raya University

Email: 1bahing@edu.upr.ac.id, 2mayangparay@gmail.com

Article History:

Received: 03-11-2024 Revised: 11-11-2024 Accepted: 06-12-2024

Keywords:

PBL, Listening Skill, TOIEC Test

Abstract: This research was highly concerned with the study of Problem-based learning in listening materials. This aimed at finding out whether or not problem-based learning could be developed to strengthen students' listening skill. This research was an experimental one, which aimed to find out the effect of using Problem-based learning method to increase students' listening skill. The population of this research was the sixth semester students of Indonesian academy of secretary and management Indonesi (ASMI) Citra Nusantara Banjarmasin. Sample were students majoring Financial Management 1 as control group. It was obtained by using purpose sampling technic. Experimental group was taught by using Problem-based Learning method which consisted of 22 students. While control group was taught by using conventional method consisted of 23 students. The instrument of this research was TOEIC of listening comprehension Test. Problem-based Learning method was more effective to increase students' Listening skill at Indonesia Academy of Secretary and management of Indonesia (ASMI) Citra Nusantara Banjarmasin than the conventional method. It was indicated by the result of independent sample of T-test, and it was found Significant. Tail 2 value was 0,000< 0,05. It meant there was significant different in students' listening skill between Experimental Group and the Control Group. In group statistics table said that the mean of experimental group was 275,91. It was higher than the mean of control group 194,7. It could be stated that Ho was rejected, and ha was accepted. In other words, Problem-based learning method in teaching listening skill could developed the students' listening skill better than the conventional one.



INTRODUCTION

English Proficiency is crucial today since it reflected a lot of things. In addition to being convenient, learning English would make it simpler for us to comply with all of the terms and conditions that had been set forth. People who wanted to study or to work in the nations where English was the primary language that had increased the desire to acquire and become proficient in the language as a result of globalization.

Many business men with global markets utilize English as their working media or language. They used tests to measure The English proficiency of potential collaborators because they want to make sure that it is high quality. They employed the TOIEC test as a tool for Hiring. It assessed candidates on their oral and written linguistic abilities, and it was becoming a reference tool for recruitment, given that is is used in every country in the world. It also occurred at the Academy of secretary and management ASMI Citra Nusantara, Banjarmasin, which requires the TOEIC tests the students in order to allow them to graduate from college. The reason, the college has this regulation is because students would be hired by corporations after graduating. TOIEC Certificate is therefore required.

The educational testing (ETS) established the Test of English for international Communication (TOEIC) in Japan in the 1970s. The TOEIC test could be used to determine if a person has the English communication ability required for the work place or to participate in Globalization. It assessed how effectively non-native English speakers could use the language in their day-to-day job tasks.

The majority of schools and institutions required students to learn English enough though it is not the primary language in Indonesia. Students learning English as a foreign language (EFL) obviously had some difficulties. Every student faced difficulties when trying to learn English, as Abdulrahman (2013:50) noted. One of the four categories of English competence that needed to master was Listening skill. That is to understand or listening comprehension.

The students needed to develop their listening skill as part of their language learning. In order to respond effectively, a person must be able to comprehend what they are listening to, and this is referred to as listening competency. Listening competency also help a person become communicatively competent (Yildiz & Albay, 2015: 30). In order to effectively, communicate, to understand others and lecturers during the college learning process and in daily life, and to prepare students for their careers after graduating from college, listening is an oral skill that is crucial to study.

However, listening comprehension was common challenge for students. It may be revealed using the data gathered during the researcher's interview with the lecturer and when the researcher obtained the TOEIC scores of the students from their lecturers in June 2022 at the Indonesian Academy and Secretary ASMI Citra Nusantara Banjarmasin. The result was their TOEIC in listening score was low. They have struggle to comprehend the foreign language's actual sounds. Every important keyword must be understood by them. They can understand if the speaker spoke slowly, but they could not understand whenever the speech was spoken quickly in their original accent. They needed repeated listening in order to understand them fully. They become exhausted and find it difficult to concentrate in the listening session lasted for a long time.





In Reality, teaching listening skill is challenging. Even students find it difficult to develop their listening skill (M. Putri & Sinaga, 2020:14). Teachers needed an innovative teaching technique or strategy to be better at listening comprehension. Teacher could teach studentsin in listening through a variety of effective techniques. Problem based-learning (PBL) was one of them. Problem-based learning method in this study would be abbreviated PBL.

PBL was a method of instruction that had students solve real-world problems while using their critical thinking skills in order to gain knowledge and learn how to make conclusions. They would be encourage to gather information and data to solve difficulties an the authentic problem serve as the foundation for PBL Learning.

According to Barrows (1996:71) PBL has the following characteristics: (1) it is problem requiring students to solve an actual (real) problem that they would come into outside of classroom, (2) applying problem solving abilities needed for their employment to the learning process, (3) learners learn to be responsible for their own learning in students-centered environment, (4) through self-directed learning, students acquire research skill since they must compile up-to date knowledge in order to complete the problem solving process, (5) reflection: students consider what they have learned about the problems, its main aspects, and how it relates to other problems they have faced in the past. This enhances the transfer of information to use in the future.

Using the proceeding context as foundation, the researcher conducted a research title "The effectiveness of Problem-based learning (PBL) in Students' Listening Skill in the TOEIC Listening Materials at Indonesian Academy of Secretary and Management (ASMI) Citra Nusantara Banjarmasin". The purposes of the research was to see whether employing PBL had many effects on students' listening skill of Indonesian Academy of Secretary and Management (ASMI) Citra Nusantara Banjarmasin. Additionally, the researcher was interested in finding out whether the students at Indonesian Academy of Secretary and Management (ASMI) citra Nusabtara Banjarmasin who were taught using PBL had batter Listening Scores than those who were taught using conventional one.

In this case, the researcher would like to use a quasi-experimental design to find out the respond in research Questions. Based on the research background, the researcher formulated the following problem:

"Do students of Indonesian academy of Secretary and Management (ASMI) citra nusantara Banjarmasin taught by using problem-based learning (PBL) achieved better scores in listening skill than those students who taught by using conventional method?"

Based on the research problem above, the researcher stated that the objectives of this study was: To investigate the effectiveness of the use of Problem based learning (PBL) in developing the students' listening Skill.

Then the researcher would like to state the hypothesis as follows:

"Students of Indonesia Academy of Secretary and Management (ASMI) citra nusantara Banjarmasin taught by using Problem-based learning (PBL) achieved a better Scores in Listening skill than those students who were taught by using conventional one. I formulated it in the following statement:

Ha = students who taught by using Problems' based learning, and



Ho = students who taught by using conventional method. And if Ha was accepted, thereby Ho is rejected, or whenever Ho is accepted so Ha was rejected.

This research was only concerned with how to apply problem-based learning in the skill of listening done by the students of Indonesian Academy of Secretary and Management (ASMI) Citra Nusantara, Banjarmasin. This was the limitation of this research.

The significance of this research was expected to be important in practical and theoretical in the following ways:

1. Theoretical

This research offers guidance on how to choose the suitable approach for teaching listening skill;

2. Practical

The result of this research would help other students for developing their listening skill, beside their TOEIC listening scores would also increase.

Then in terms of clarification, it was necessary to set the clarification as follows

1. Listening Skill

The capability to recognize and to comprehend what others are saying is known as listening skill. To entail comprehending the meaning as well as the speakers' accent, pronunciation, syntax, and lexical. One of the most crucial abilities in learning English is listening, yet as evidence by the Indonesian Academy of Secretary and management (ASMI), Citra Nusantara Banjarmasin, listening was still lacking.

2. Problem-based Learning (PBL)

Problem-based Learning was a teaching method that promotes the development of innovation and innovative based learning, engaging high level students. In This method, students would learn by connecting the ideas and details of materials through Problems-based learning (PBL) not by passively consuming it.

3. Test of English For International Communication (TOEIC)

An international standard Assessment of English Language Ability for non-native speaker of English is named TOEIC. It is specifically made to assess how well individual working abroad can communicate in English on a daily basis. There are two sections of TOEIC test, they are listening comprehension and reading comprehension. However, in this research, researcher only focus on listening comprehension.

METHOD

. In this research, a quasi- experimental design was utilized. It analyzed the outcomes of the pre-and post-test for the research design. That is pre-and post-tests on two differences, that is Problem-based learning and listening skill. As a result, the design is known as a pretest and post-test control group design. The method for the result was adopted from (Ary, et al 2002:308).

Table: 3.1

| Group | Research Design | | Post-Test |
|-------|-----------------|----------------------|-----------|
| | Pre-Test | Independent variable | |
| Е | Y1 | X1 | Y2 |
| С | Y1 | X2 | Y2 |



Notes:

E : Group in experiment C : Group in control

X1 : Treatment utilizing PBL method

X2 : Treatment not utilizing the PBL method

Y1 : Pre-test Y2 : Post-test

The design of this research consisted of two group, they are experimental-group and control group. The experimental group was given a treatment. The researcher gave three times treatments for experimental group by using problem-based learning. While for control group, researcher gave conventional teaching for three sessions. Researcher gave three times treatment for experimental group. While for control group researcher gave conventional method for three meeting.

1. Population and Sample

1. Population

The subjects of this research were the sixth semester students of ASMI Citra Nusantara, Banjarmasin in academic year 2019/2020 majoring in Management Business (MB) now Business Administration (AB). The number of population was 56 students. They were as follows:

Table: 3.2 Population of ASMI Citra Nusantara, Banjarmasin

| No. | Class | Number of Students |
|-----|-----------------------------------|--------------------|
| 1 | Information Technology Management | 11 |
| 2 | Financial business management 1 | 22 |
| 3 | Financial business management 2 | 33 |
| | Total population | 56 |

2. Sample

An essential part of performing a research study is selecting the sample. A sample is part of population which data would be examined. Sample must be representative as one is to be able to generalize would confidence from the sample to population. According to Arikunto (2006:109) a sample ought to be representative of population. Ary (2002: 163) defined a sample as a subset of the population. A good sample should be as representative of the entire population as feasible in order to generalize the results of this sample.

According to (Riduan:2008:57), there are two types of sampling Procedures used frequently in research, those are (1) Probability sampling, (2) Non-probability sampling. Probability is a sampling technique to provide equal opportunity for each member to be selected as a member of sample, which includes simple random sampling, stratified random sampling, cluster random sampling, area sampling, etc. meanwhile, non-probability sampling is a technique that does not provide an opportunity for every member of the population to be used as a member of sample, including systematic sampling, quoata sampling, accidental sampling, purposive sampling, saturation sampling, and snowball sampling.

Sampling technique used in this research was purposive sampling. It is a sampling technique with certain considerations. The reason for using the purposive technique is



because it requires two classes that are homogeneous in ability and it can represent the characteristics of the population. Purposive sampling is the process of selecting a sample that is a sample by selecting a subject that is obtained based on the specific purpose rather than the level or location, according to Arikunto (2010:183).

In addition, according to Mulyatiningsih, E (2012:94) purposive sampling is used when the target population has specific charateristics, so that only subjects who meet these specific requirement can be used as a research samples. He also said, in quasi-experimental research, purposive sampling is often chosen when the researcher only has 1 population group, so there is no consideration choosing another sample. Whenever this sampling strategy was chosen, the research findings could only be applied to the group that was subject of the research and could not be applied to other groups.

The decision is Choosing sample, were made with the consideration as follows:

- 1. There are 2 classes had almost the same average of TOEIC Listening scores;
- 2. The two classes were taught by the same lectuter.

In this research, financial business management 1 class was taught by using PBL method, while financial business management 2 was taught by using conventional one.

Therefore, the researcher got two classes, they were Financial Business Management 1 and Financial Business 2. The researcher employed simple random sampling to determine which class was as the experimental group and which class was as the control group. A simple random sample was meant as provided an unbiased representation of a group. It was considered a just technique of choosing a simple from a bigger population because each member of the population has an a equal probability of being chosen. Thus, simple random sampling was recognized for its randomness and reduced chance of sample bias.

The researcher employed a lottery procedure. Therefore, financial business management 1 class was chosen as the experimental group which the students were taught using PBL model, whereas financial business management 2 class was chosen as the control group and students were taught through the conventional teaching model.

This Research was taken place in ASMI Citra Nusantara Banjarmasin. It is located in Gang Teluk Dalam, Banjarmasin. It is established since 2007, which was established based on SK. No.171/Do/2007. Asmi cinus is a University that provides 3 (three) years of Vocational Education or Diploma 3.

This research started in July 18th 2022. The research met with the participant in her research five times: the pre-test was given at the first meeting. The experimental group then received PBL model at second until the fourth meeting, whereas the control group received traditional or conventional model. Each group received a post-test at the last meeting on August 23nd, 2022.

2. The Data of Research

In this section, the researcher discussed about kinds of data that is the data model collection and analysis, and admissibility of the data.

3. Kinds of Data

The data was obtained from the interval data which taken from the TOEIC listening score of students of control group and experimental group. The students in the experimental





were taught using PBL, while conventional teaching model were used to teach the students in the control group.

4. Data Collection Procedure

The researcher employed a view procedures to get the data for this research. The procedures consist of several steps as follows:

- (1) the researcher gave pre-test to the control group and experimental group;
- (2) the experimental group was taught using PBL by the researcher;
- (3) the researcher taught the control group by using conventional model;
- (4) both the experimental group and the control group received post-test from the researcher;
- (5) the researcher revealed that the data were homogeneous and normal;
- (6) to analyze the data, the researcher Have used SPSS 25.00 version sofwere;
- (7) the data analysis finding were analyzed and drawn by the researcher.

5. Data Analysis

The data analysis method employed in this research was a parametric statistical analysis (ANOVA). More over, the researcher used a computer Program as the instrument to analyze the data, namely SPSS 25.0 program. The purpose of utilizing ANOVA was to access the impact of PBL on the Indonesian Academy Secretary and Management (ASMI) Citra Nusantara Banjarmasin students in their listening skill. In addition, to compare students' listening skill between students who taught through the PBL model and those students who taught by using traditional/conventional model.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The researcher addressed the findings in this chapter, which included a description of data, an analysis of data, and discussion.

1. Result

The outcomes were based on the pre-test and post-test. Before the treatment was started, it utilized as the initial as the initial data to access the students' capacity for listening before treatment. In the last meeting, the same post-test was administered. The data descriptions were explained as follows:

1. 1. The Description of Experiment class with Problem-based Learning (PBL)

There were several steps to make in the experimental groups. This group' students first took a pre-test. The second, PBL was introduced to students. The last step, they took a post-test after receiving treatment. Research implementation in the experimental group can be described as follows:

| Pre-test | Learning through PBL | Post-test |
|----------|----------------------|-----------|
| | Implementation | |



1.2. Pre-test

Students in the experiment group were given a pre-test before PBL was introduced implemented to them. The pre-test for students in this group was conducted on July, 18^{th} , 2024 at 8.00-10.00. All students in the attendance list participated in the test. The following table was the result of the of the students' pre-test in the experimental group.

The pre-test Result Experimental Group

| | Pre-Experiment | | | |
|-------------------|------------------|--------|--|--|
| N | Valid | 22 | | |
| | Missing | 1 | | |
| Mean | | 181,36 | | |
| Std Error of Mean | | 11,794 | | |
| | | | | |
| Median | | 195,00 | | |
| Mode | 225 | | | |
| Std. Deviation | Deviation 53,317 | | | |
| Variance | 3059,957 | | | |
| Range | | 235 | | |
| Minimum | | 40 | | |
| Maximum | | 275 | | |
| Sum of | 3990 | | | |

According to the result of the experiment group's pre-test, which were displayed in the table above, the minimum scores was 40 and the highest score was 275. The pre-test mean was 181,36 as well. The median value was 195.00, the mode was 225, and the standard deviation was 55.317.

1.3. Implementation of PBL in Learning Listening

The experimental group used the problem-based learning (PBL) to facilitate learning. The experimental group received this model this model over the course of three meetings, with each meeting lasting two hours of learning. Each meeting in this research involved the following stages for the implementation of the problem-based learning (PBL) model:

1. Orientation of the Problem

First, the researcher conveyed to the students about the learning objectives she wanted to achieved. It was a listening comprehension of the audio with the theme in TOEIC listening section. Then, the researcher presented a problem that were expected to be solved by the students in their group in the listening learning process.

The problem in this case, is in the form of an audio. Problem were used to increase curiosity, analytical skills, as well initiative. As a lecturer also I acted as a motivator so that



each student was directly involved in problem solving. The things that students should do in this stage was recognizing and recording the language, sentences, and expressions of speakers.

2. Discussion

In this research, there were two groups, namely (!) t2he experimental group and (2) control group. The subjects of this research were Financial Business Management 1 class with 22 students and Financial Business Management 2 class with 23 students. After doing the purposive sampling Technique, researcher got the financial business management 1 class as an experimental group using the problem- based learning model, and the financial business management 2 class as the control group with the conventional teaching-learning model. The implementation of this research both groups were carried out in three meetings by taking the topic that accordance with the TOEIC listening materials.

The result showed that, after getting treatment students who taught PBL have higher achievement (scores) compared to those who used conventional teaching method. The group of statistics showed that the mean value for the experimental group was greater than the mean value for the control group. The experiment group's mean scores through PBL was 275.91 while the control group mean was 194.57. It can be said that the students at ASMI Citra Nusantara, Banjarmasin who are taught using PBL did better in listening skill than those who were taught using conventional one.

The increase in the experimental group was due to the implementation of Problem-based learning (PBL). Students learn through group work and carry out investigation to solve the problem given. In the learning process, they also conducted investigations under the guidance of a lecturer. Besides that, they learned to look for references or learning resources related to the problems. Students become more motivated to learn as a result. They were not afraid to ask or responded to the lecturer's questions. They paid close attention to whatever the instructor said.

The result showed that, after getting treatment, students who taught through PBL have higher achievement compared to those who taught through Traditional method or conventional one. The control group also experience an increase but not too significant because the students received learning activities using the conventional teaching model. Student were asked to pay attention to the lecturer. After that, they practiced the listening task from the book '600essential words for the TOEIC third addition. by Lind Lougheed (2008) and the questions were related to audio played. The last,, they were expected to answer the question and deliver a message well. They were only a few students that wanted to talk and respond when the researcher checked students' understanding by asking questions about the materials.

CONCLUSION

In this research, researcher wanted to know whether the problem-based learning (PBL) achieve better scores than conventional teaching in students' listening skill.

Based on the calculation of Independent sample T-test using SPSS statistic program it shows that the significance value (2tailed) is > (higher than) 0,05, then it can be concluded



that there was no significance difference between experimental group which taught by using PBL and control group which taught by using conventional teaching.

Based on the table of group of statistic, it showed that the mean value for the experiment group (taught by using PBL) was 275.95. While the mean value for control group (taught by using conventional teaching) was 194.57. It can interpreted that Ho is rejected and Ha is accepted. In conclusion, PBL has better effect in the sixth semester students' listening skill of Indonesia Academy and secretary (ASMI) Citra Nusantara Banjarmasin than those students taught by using conventional teaching.

REFERENCES

- [1] Abdulrahman, H. 2013. What are the difficulties and Problems In Learning English.
- [2] Anas Sudijono. 2011. Pengantar statistic pendidikan. Jakarta. Raja Grafindo Persada.
- [3] Anderson & Lynch. 1988. Listening. Editor: Canadian & Widdowson. New York, Oxford University Press.
- [4] Annisa, Nur.2009. The implementation of "Problem-based Learning" to improve Students' Learning Outcomes and Creativity (Study on Students of class XI Taking APK-2 Program in SMK Negeri 1 Turen on Subject Training of Mail handling.
- [5] Ansarian, L & Mohammadi, F.S. (2018) Problem-base Learning in Action Review of Empirical Studies, Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities, 26 (T) 13-32
- [6] Anwar, C. 2017. The Effectiveness of Problem-based learning integrated with Islamic Values baseb on higher order thinking skill and students' character. Al-Ta Lim Journal, 23(3) 224-231.
- [7] Arikunto. S. 2006. Metode penelitian Kualitative, Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- [8] Arikunto, S. 2010. Prosedur Penelitian suatu pendekatan Praktik, Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- [9] Ary, Jacob et al. 2002. Introduction To Research in Education. Belmon: wadsworth.
- [10] Ary, Donald. 2002. Introducation to Research in Education. United States of America: wardworth Group.
- [11] Bambang, Riyanto. 2001. Dasar dasar pembelajaran perusahaan. BPFE, Yoyakarta.
- [12] Borrows, H.S. 1996. Problem-based learning in medicine and beyond: A Brief Overview New Directions for Teaching and Learning (68). (3 12).
- [13] .Cahyono, B.Y. 1997. Pengajaran Bahasa Inggris: Technique, Strategi, dan hasil Penelitian. (Teaching English: Techniques, Strategies, and research Result). Malang: IKIP Malang.
- [14] Cook, L. Rumril P.R. 2005. Internal Validity in Rehabilition research. Work: J. Prevention, Assessment Rehabilition 25(3): 279-283.
- [15] De Graaf, E & Kolmon, A. 2003. Characteristics of Problem based learning. International Journal of Engineering Education, 19(3): 657-662.
- [16] Ibrahim, Nur. 2002. Pembelajaran berbasis Masalah. Surabaya: UNNESA.
- [17] Gultom, Juwita sari. 2018. The Effect of Using Problem –based Learning Method on Students' Listening ability in Listening. Thesis FKIP, Universitas Muhammadiyah, Sumatra Utara.
- [18] Larson, J.2001. Problem-based Learning: A Possible Approach To Language Education. Cambridge University Press.





- [19] Lin, L. F. 2019. 2017. Impacts of Problem-based Learning Pedagogy on English Learners' Reafing Comprehnsion, Strategy use, and active Learning attitudes. Journal of Education and training Studies, 5(6), 109-125.
- Lin Teoh Mei. 2019. The Effect of Problem-based learning on the Listening. The [20] Journal of ASIA TEFL Vol. 16, No.3 Fall 2019, 996-1004.
- [21] Lyn, Dawes. 2008. The Essential Speaking and Listening: Talk for Learning at Key Stage 2. (New York: Routledge), 41.
- Ma, Angela Kit Fong. 2008. An Investigation of Students Teachers' Attitudes to the [22] use of Media Triggered problem-base learning. Australian Journal of Educational Teknology 2008, 24(3), 311-325.
- Mulyatiningsih, E. 2012. Metode Penelitian Terapan Bidang Pendidikan, Bandung: [23]
- [24] Murcia, C. 1995. Teaching English as s second or foreign language. Second edition, Boston.
- [25] Putri M & Sinaga, J.B. 2020. The Effect of Watching Movie to Improve Students 'listening skill. Anglo Saxon: Journal Ilmiah Bahasa Inggris
- [26] Richards, J.C.. 2010. Rymniak. 1977 and TOIEC Examine H and book (P39).
- [27] Richards, J.C. and Smith, R. 2010. Longman Dictionary, Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics. Pearson, UK.
- Richards, J.C.et al N. 2010. English for International Community. Cambridge [28] University Press.
- Riduan, 2018. Metode dan Teknik menyusun Thesis, Bandung: Alfabeta [29]
- [30] Prayoga Moch. Ridwan. 2012. Teaching Listening Skill using audio Lingual method a first Grade Students of Asrama Bengkel Bahasa Course, (Bandung: STKIP) Silingwangi.
- Rost, M. (3). 2002. Teaching and researching Listening. London, UK: Longman [31]
- Rosenthal, H. 1992. The Effect of "Problem-based learning on Problem Solving". [32] Gifted Child Ouarterly.
- [33] Savery, J. R. 2006. Overview of Problem-Based Learning: Definitions and distinctions. The interdisciplinary Journal of Problem-based learning, I(1):9-20.
- [34] Shin, L. K. & Azman, N. 2014. Problem-based Learning in English for a Second Language Classroom: Students' Perspectives. International Journal of Learning, 18(6), 109-126.
- [35] Suparsi, Sri. 2010. The Effort to Improve the Speaking skill in a report result Discussion with Problem-based Learning approach (A classroom Action Research in the second grade of Marketing Problem at SMK Pancasila 7 Pracimantoro Wonogiri Academic Year 2010/2011.
- [36] Taufik, Muh. 2009. Innovasi Pendidikan melalui PBL
- Thaib. 2010. Use of learning Model PBL for improve Students in Speaking. [37]
- [38] Tha Nation. 2003 (Job PP4-10), Bangkok Post (Classified "ppl 1-5).
- [39] Walker, A Leary, H. & Lefler, M. 2015. A Meta Analysis of PBL: Examination of Education Levels, Discipline, Assessment Levels, Problem types, Implementation types, and reasoning strategies. In Essential reading in PBL (pp.303-329. Purdue University Press.

5338 JIRK Journal of Innovation Research and Knowledge Vol.4, No.8, Januari 2025



[40] Wardah. 2013. The effectiveness of PBL method to teach Speaking Skill viewed from students' Critical thinking (an experimental Study) at the second semester of English Program Students of FKIP Tanjungpura University Pontianak. Pontianak University.

THIS PAGE IS INTENTIONALLY BLANK